THE LONG STRANGE CAREER OF A HANDEL MISATTRIBUTION, 1727–2013

As recently as 2013, a beginning flute student preparing for the Grade 2 flute exam administered by The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (a British music examination agency) might have ended up practicing a short march by G. F. Handel. The piece was labeled “A March in Richard the First.” (This referred of course to the 1727 opera more properly known as Riccardo Primo.) The March is indeed by Handel, but it is not from “Richard the First.” In fact, it comes from an earlier Handel opera, Floridante (1721)—one of two Marches in that opera.

I stumbled on the origin of this little mistake two years ago, in the course of writing a paper for the American Handel Society Conference in Iowa about the appropriation of the (real) Riccardo Primo March for use as an early Methodist hymn in 1742. As I was searching for the earliest printings of the March, copies the Methodists might have used in fashioning their hymn, I came across several instances of the very same misattribution—a March from Floridante given the erroneous title “March in Richard the Ist.” The following report, then, is an account of the odd trajectory that created this misattribution and caused it to linger into the present—and, because some of the youthful flutists who learned this piece just a few years ago are barely teenagers, perhaps into the foreseeable future as well.

The mistake first surfaced with the English music publisher John Walsh, Sr. In 1729 Walsh brought out a set of Handel miscellanies, 60 minuets and a dozen marches he had assembled from diverse sources, transcribed for solo flute or violin and published as A General Collection. Leading off the set of twelve Marches was the misattributed “March in Richard the Ist.”

As it turns out, the second March in Walsh’s 1729 Handel collection adds to the confusion. Printed on the same page as and directly below the erroneously-named “March in Richard the Ist,” this second piece is

ANOTHER REFERENCE TO HANDEL IN THE MONTAGU CORRESPONDENCE

Ellen Harris, in her award-winning book George Frideric Handel: A Life with Friends (New York: W.W. Norton, 2014), introduces the reader to the appealing figure of Anne Donnellan (c. 1700–1762), who was also featured in the exhibition of the same title curated by Prof. Harris and presented at Handel & Hendrix in London (formerly Handel House Museum) between July 1, 2015 and January 10, 2016.1 Donnellan was a gifted amateur singer, a skilled conversationalist and a perceptive critic, as witnessed in her correspondence with Samuel Richardson on the subject of his novels.

Mrs. Donnellan, so styled although she never married, was the daughter of Nehemiah Donnellan, Chief Baron of the Irish Exchequer from 1702 until his death in 1705. Her mother subsequently married Philip Percival, younger brother of Sir John Percival, who became the Earl of Egmont in 1733 and whose diary is often cited. Donnellan’s family moved from Dublin to London in the late 1720s where she quickly became friends with her exact contemporary, the widowed Mary Granville Pendarves (later Mrs. Delany), and also became a friend and keen supporter of Handel. Through Mrs. Pendarves she was introduced to Margaret Cavendish Harley (1715–1785), Duchess of Portland following her 1734 marriage to William Bentinck, and around 1740 to her protégé Elizabeth Robinson (1718–1800), subsequently to be known under her married name of Montagu as “The Queen of the Bluestockings.”2

Donnellan was staying with the Duchess of Portland, presumably at her London house, when she wrote a letter to Elizabeth Robinson dated only “April


identified simply as “March”—no further provenance given (see musical example). But in fact it turns out to be the actual March from Riccardo Primo—its first printing anywhere.

It’s not possible to know why Walsh made this mistake (in the face of his assurance, on the title page, that the music had been “carefully corrected”). But there is one intriguing possibility, however speculative it must remain. This stems from the fact that the tunes of the two Marches contain four measures of literally identical music: as Walsh printed them, Floridante mm. 17–20 are the same as Riccardo Primo mm. 13–16. (In addition, though less conspicuously, Floridante mm. 21–25 = Riccardo Primo mm. 9–11, with their respective upbeats.) How to account for this similarity? As it happens, there was a real connection between Floridante and Riccardo Primo in Handel’s own working life. While that connection is a bit complicated, it deserves some attention here.

Floridante had of course been composed back in 1721, but Handel revived it briefly in 1727 (from April 30 to May 2). Those were the very days when he would also have been working on Riccardo Primo, which he completed on May 16. However, that May version of Riccardo did not contain the March; Handel wrote one only later in the year, for use in the radically revised second version of Riccardo Primo that would finally be performed in November 1727. But the critical commentary in the Hallische Händel-Ausgabe edition of Riccardo Primo (edited by Terence Best) reveals that the key manuscript source of that opera is missing a single leaf—a leaf that would have been located precisely where the March should be. (Handel wrote the extant manuscript of the March on a separate sheet of paper.) Best writes that there is “no evidence” of what music Handel had written in that missing leaf, suggesting only that “it may have been some recitative, or a first version of the March.” If the missing leaf did in fact contain an early version of the March, it is tempting to speculate that this early version was nothing other than the older March from Floridante—and that Handel then made a last-minute decision to replace it with a new, original March for Riccardo Primo. The Floridante March would certainly have been in his head when he did so. If that’s what happened, it’s not terribly far-fetched to imagine that the missing manuscript leaf (or a copy) ended up in John Walsh’s hands, and that it had been labeled—at the time correctly!—“March in Richard the Ist.” In that scenario, the misattribution would have originated not with Walsh but with Handel himself. We could then say that parsing a printer’s error has offered us a tiny glimpse into Handel’s compositional practice.

In any case, Walsh’s error had legs. The Floridante March, with its now-misleading title “March in Richard the First,” was reprinted eight more times over the course of the 18th century, brought out by several publishers in collections for either flute or (in one case) harpsichord; several of these were instructional books. Meanwhile, over the same period the actual March from Riccardo Primo received sixteen additional printings (designed for a variety of instruments)—although not until 1745 was the Riccardo Primo March first identified by its proper 1727 operatic name.

Not surprisingly, the printings of both these Marches clustered during the time of the Seven Years’ War. One or the other of them came out at least eight times between 1758 and 1763. Each of the two, still identified respectively as “March in Richard the First” (i.e., Floridante) and simply “March” (Riccardo Primo) appeared on adjacent pages in a large and well-selling 1758 collection of military marches—many of them by Handel—published by John Walsh, Jr., and given the appropriately bellicose overall title Warlike Musick. The younger Walsh printed the Marches for a solo instrument and provided them with a mostly unfigured bass. Otherwise, the son had simply lifted the father’s earlier error intact.

And there, more or less, the matter apparently stood for more than two centuries, until 1974, when the renowned British musician and teacher Philip Ledger (later knighted for his work) brought out with Oxford University Press a much-abridged version of the younger Walsh’s Warlike Musick of 1758, designed (as Walsh’s volume had also been) for flute, oboe, or violin. Ledger also provided realizations of Walsh’s unfigured basses. Among the eighteen marches in Ledger’s collection were seven by Handel. This was a teaching book for young beginners, not a scholarly project, so when Ledger printed the March from Floridante, he naturally enough accepted Walsh’s erroneous attribution and gave it the title “A March in Richard the First.” (He did not include the real Riccardo March in his abridged edition of Warlike Musick.)
It was from this work by Ledger, then, that the misattribution was carried on a full generation later, in 2008, by The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (now better known as ABRSM). Beginning that year and continuing for five more, “A March in Richard the First” was one of nine pieces a young flutist could select to play from the “A” section (Baroque and Classical) of the Grade 2 exam. Once again, the error is easy to understand, given what strikes this naïve American as the extraordinary complexity of the task assigned to ABRSM’s exam preparers: 26 pieces for Grade 2 Flute alone, eight grades in all, and more than 35 instruments. Little wonder that the ABRSM workers turned un-skeptical eyes to Ledger’s 1974 book of easy pieces composed by some great masters. Little reason, too, for them to suspect they were passing along to yet another generation a small mistake whose embedded history reached back well into Handel’s own lifetime—and just might have emanated from his own pen.

— Stephen Nissenbaum (Underhill, VT)

FROM THE PRESIDENT’S DESK

The Board of Directors at its November meeting made two important decisions that will affect the membership of the Society. The first was to increase membership dues in all categories in an effort to deal with the increase in expenses since dues were last raised some ten years ago in 2006. The new dues structure will take effect in 2017 and are reflected on the Membership Form included with this issue of the Newsletter.

The second decision comes in response to requests from a number of our members to receive their copies of the Newsletter in electronic form. When you renew your membership for 2017 – which the Secretary/Treasurer urges you to do sooner rather than later – you will be asked to select the method of delivery. Subscribers will, of course, continue to receive the Newsletter in printed form. The Society hopes to begin electronic delivery in the near future – perhaps as soon as spring 2017 – and the plan is for electronic delivery to become the default choice in the near future.

As we approach the end of the year 2016, I hope as many of you as possible are making plans to attend AHS Princeton in April 2017. A copy of the program is printed in this issue of the Newsletter, and the Society owes a debt of gratitude to the Program Committee chaired by Rob Ketterer and to Wendy Heller and Ireri Chavez Barcenas who are in charge of local arrangements.

— Graydon Beeks

RECENT PUBLICATIONS


Händel-Jahrbuch 62 (2016) [Select titles in English]

Aspden, Suzanne. “Handel’s Epigones in the late 18th Century,” 251–263.


ye 27th." Since it reports that “Pen [i.e. Mrs. Pendarves] is gone to Northend to stay till she goes to Glocester [sic],” the date of the letter must be April 27, 1741. Robinson had just returned to her family home at Mount Morris, near Hythe in Kent, after living with the Bentincks for the previous several months. Donnellan goes on to say that “Lord George came in he & I had a warm dispute about Handel & musick, I own, I do not think his Lordship a great musician, a good disputant, nor extreemly [sic] well bred. All which diverted the Dutchess [sic] much, modesty & good breeding, make up for want of Sense & often make people more agreeable than the brightest understanding without them, but bold and positive assertions shoud [sic] have a very good foundation.”3

Lord George Bentinck (1715–1759) was the Duke of Portland’s younger brother and thus the brother-in-law of the Duchess. He was a soldier by trade and also served as MP for Grampound and Malmesbury. His views on music are not known, but from Donnellan’s comments we can probably conclude that he was not a supporter of Handel – or, at least, not an enthusiastic enough supporter to satisfy her. It would be interesting to know the details of their “warm dispute,” but unless another source turns up, this will have to remain a passing – if tantalizing – reference.

— Graydon Beeks

3 Huntington Library, MS MO 752.

AMERICAN HANDEL FESTIVAL 2017

https://ahs2017.princeton.edu

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY
(PRINCETON, NJ) APRIL 6-9, 2017

Preliminary Program

The Howard Serwer Memorial Lecture and all Conference Sessions will be held in the Taplin Auditorium in Fine Hall.

Thursday, April 6, 2017

5:00pm Welcome Reception – Woolworth Music Center Lobby

7:00pm Howard Serwer Memorial Lecture
John Butt (University of Glasgow)

Friday, April 7, 2017

8:00am Breakfast and Coffee

8:30-10:30am Paper Session I: Text, Music & Rhetoric

Andrés Locatelli
No se emenderá jamás (HWV 140): Emending and Contextualizing Handel’s Spanish Cantata

Fredric Fehleisen
I know, or at least I think I know: Grammar, Musical-Rhetoric, and Coherence in the First Song in Part III of Handel’s Messiah

Minji Kim
Handel’s Chorus “I will sing unto to the Lord” in Israel in Egypt, Cannons Anthem Let God arise, and Non Nobis Domine

Coffee break

10:45-12:05pm Paper Session II: Oratorio

Kenneth Nott
“By Thee kings reign, by Thee they fall”: Operatic Elements in Handel’s Alexander Balus

Ruth Smith
Picking out Paths for Priests in Handel’s English Oratorios

12:05-1:00pm Lunch for conference registrants – Professors’ Lounge at Fine Hall

1:00-3:00pm Paper Session III: Singers

Randall Scotting
A Calculated Triumph: Farinelli, Handel, and the Misappropriation of the 1734 Aria “Son qual nave”

David Vickers
Giulia Frasi in English music

Lawrence Zazzo
“O Athamas... I cannot utter it”: Who sang the Italian arias in the 1744 revival of Semele?

Trinity Church, Princeton, 33 Mercer St.

3:00pm Reception – Parish Hall

4:15pm Pre-concert Lecture by Malcolm Bruno

5:00pm Handel, Messiah (selections from the 1741 Dublin version). Presented by the Princeton University Chamber Choir and Nassau Sinfonia. John Butt, conductor. Admission Free
Saturday, April 8, 2017

8:30am   Breakfast and Coffee
9:00-10:20am   **Paper Session IV: Scribes and Editors**

Donald Burrows  
“You can’t have it of Smith except you have it wrote out on purpose”: Copyists of Handel’s Music in London

Natassa Varka  
Charles Jennens’s Version of *Joseph and his Brethren*

Coffee break

10:40-12:00pm   **Paper Session V: Performing Matters**

Luke Howard  
Tempo Trends through 200 years of *Messiah* Performances

Andrew Lawrence-King  
George and the Dragon Harp

12:00-2:00pm   Lunch on your own and AHS Board Meeting

2:00-3:20pm   **Paper Session VI: Opera**

Carlo Lanfossi  
“The Opera of Cato is not Mr Handel’s”: Performing Authorship in Handel’s Pasticci

Elizabeth Lyon  
Handel’s Siciliana and “Ritorna, o caro”: Characterization of the Feminine in *Rodelinda*

Coffee break

3:40-5:30pm   **Paper Session VII: Handel as Politics**

David Hunter  
Handel’s music in the lives of slave owners in Britain and its Caribbean and North America colonies

Joseph Lockwood  
Music for the Coronation of George II

Stephen Nissenbaum  
Using Handel against Handel?: The Hallelujah Chorus as Rejoinder to *Zadok the Priest*

6:15pm   Cocktails, Concert, and Dinner for conference registrants – Chancellor Green

Sunday, April 9, 2017

8:30-9:45am   Breakfast and AHS Members’ Business Meeting – Professors’ Lounge at Fine Hall  
Presentation by Ruth Smith and Matthew Gardner: A New Website for Handel’s Oratorios

10:00-12:00pm   **Paper Session VIII: Handel and the British Audience**

Matthew Gardner  
English Oratorio Benefits in the mid Eighteenth Century

Nick Lockey and John Burkhalter  
Handel in the Musical Landscape of the West Country 1730-1780

Beverly Jerold  
Reichardt’s Review of Handel Concerts in London

---

**NEWSLETTER OF THE AMERICAN HANDEL SOCIETY**

The Newsletter is published three times a year (Spring, Summer, and Winter). The Editor welcomes submissions in the following categories for future issues:

- Short articles (1500-2000 words);
- News of recent Handel-related events, presentations (special lectures or conference papers), and concerts organized and/or performed by members of the Society;
- Reviews of performances and recordings of Handel’s music;
- Information about awards and honors presented to members of the Society;
- News of recent publications;
- Abstracts for dissertations in progress on a Handel-related topic.

Please submit your contributions to the Editor, Minji Kim (minjik@gmail.com)
Dean Schroeder, and was inspired by Mr. Schroeder’s passion for Handel’s operatic works.

Handel Aria Competition First Prize winner Eric Jurenas commented, “I love performing Handel because it provides a deep sense of satisfaction - much like the same feeling you get after eating a gourmet meal, or finishing a months-long project. In the moment, Handel satiates that desire for satisfaction. His music is inherently enjoyable, that it’s hard to replace.”

Countertenor Eric Jurenas, Soprano Christina Kay, and Soprano Nola Richardson.

Madison, WI – July 8, 2016 – Eric Jurenas is the first countertenor to win First Prize in the Handel Aria Competition. This was the fourth year for the Handel Aria Competition, the only competition in the US focusing exclusively on the vocal repertoire of George Frideric Handel. Seven finalists were selected from a field of almost 100 singers in North America and Europe to come to Madison, Wisconsin for a live performance held in conjunction with the Madison Early Music Festival. Accompaniment was provided by the Madison Bach Musicians, directed by Trevor Stephenson.

Second Prize was awarded to soprano Christina Kay of Madison, Wisconsin. Nola Richardson, a soprano originally from Sydney, Australia, won the Third Prize and was also voted “Audience Favorite.” The other finalists were soprano Pascale Brigitte Boilard of Montreal, Canada; mezzo-soprano Adele Grabowski of New Haven, Connecticut; soprano Fiona Gillespie Jackson of Williamsport, Pennsylvania; and mezzo-soprano Elena Snow of Chicago, Illinois.

This year’s Handel Aria Competition judges were Ellen Hargis, soprano and co-artistic director of the Newberry Consort; Steven Caldecott Wilson, a member of New York Polyphony; and Christa Patton, director of the Queens College Baroque Opera Workshop.

The Handel Aria Competition was established in 2013 to encourage emerging singers to explore the operas and oratorios of George Frideric Handel. The competition was conceived by Carol “Orange” and

INTERNATIONAL HANDEL RESEARCH PRIZE 2017

In 2017 the Georg-Friedrich-Händel-Gesellschaft is to award for the third time the International Handel Research Prize to a young scholar who has completed a research project on the life or work of Handel and has presented the results in a formal research document. Research teams also may apply.

The International Handel Research prize is sponsored by the Foundation of the Saalesparkasse. It is valued at €2000 and entails the presentation of a paper to be read by the prize-winner at the scholarly conference to be held during the annual Handel Festival in Halle (an der Saale), June 6–7, 2017.

Applications may be made by graduates in musicology or related disciplines who have completed their Master’s or Doctoral studies (or equivalent research) between 2014 and 2017. Historical-critical editions may also be submitted for the prize. Studies in English or German language are accepted.

Applications should be sent by February 1, 2017 (postmarked) to:

Georg-Friedrich-Händel-Gesellschaft e.V.
Internationale Vereinigung
Geschäftsstelle
Grosse Nikolaistraße 5
D-06108 Halle (Saale)

The application must include the scholarly work undertaken (in printed and in electronic form) and be accompanied by a brief curriculum vitae and an account of the applicant’s career.

The selection of the prize-winner will be made by a panel from the Foundation of the Saalesparkasse and the Georg-Friedrich-Händel-Gesellschaft. The prize will be presented at the scholarly conference of the Handel Festival in Halle, June 2017.

For the PDF file please go to http://haendel.de/Gesellschaft/haendel-forschungspreis
The American Handel Society
School of Music, University of Maryland, College Park, MD 20742
Telephone: (909) 607-3568 Email: info@americanhandelsociety.org
www.americanhandelsociety.org

OFFICERS AND DIRECTORS

Graydon Beeks, President, Pomona College
Minji Kim, Newsletter Editor, Andover, MA
Corbett Bazler, University of Rochester
Norbert Dubowy, Stiftung Mozarteum Salzburg
Roger Freitas, Eastman School of Music
William D. Gudger, Honorary Director, College of Charleston
Ellen T. Harris, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Wendy Heller, Princeton University
David Hurley, Pittsburg State University
Robert Ketterer, University of Iowa

Nathan Link, Vice President, Centre College
Marjorie Pomeroy, Secretary/Treasurer, Sandwich, MA
Richard G. King, University of Maryland
Kenneth Nott, Hartt School of Music
Lowell Lindgren, Honorary Director, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Nicholas McGegan, Honorary Director, Berkeley, CA
John H. Roberts, University of California, Berkeley
Marty Ronish, Edmonds, WA
Ellen Rosand, Yale University

The American Handel Society – Membership Form

Please mail the completed form and appropriate membership dues as instructed below:

Name __________________________________________________________________________ Date ___________________________________________
Address __________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
City______________________________________________State/Country _________________ Postal code _____________________________________
E-mail address ___________________________________________________________________ Phone _________________________________________

☐ I wish to have my copy of the Newsletter delivered by U.S. mail
☐ I wish to have my copy of the Newsletter delivered electronically

Class of Membership — Circle applicable cell(s) (for current calendar year, unless otherwise specified) $ ‚ £ €

Regular 35 28 30
Joint (one set of publications) 42 34 38
Donor 56 45 50
Student or Retired 20 15 18
Sponsor 100 80 90
Patron 200 145 160
Life 500 400 450
Subscriber (Institutions Only) 42 34 40
Membership in the Georg-Friedrich-Händel-Gesellschaft – Regular 45 - 40
Membership in the Georg-Friedrich-Händel-Gesellschaft – Student* 20 - 15
Friend of the Handel Institute, London – Regular 30 20 -
Friend of the Handel Institute, London – Student* 15 10 -
Donation to The American Handel Society

TOTAL REMITTANCE

* This organization does not have a reduced rate for retirees.

Payments in dollars for GFH or HI memberships must be received before 1 June.